2022: A work of Policy Development Section @MAHER Consulting

# **STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT IN CLIMATE FINANCE:**

ANALYZING HOW DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDERS, FROM GOVERNMENT AGENCIES TO CIVIL SOCIETY, CAN COLLABORATE TO ENSURE THE TRANSPARENT FLOW AND USE OF CLIMATE FUNDS



## STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT IN CLIMATE FINANCE:

ANALYZING HOW DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDERS, FROM GOVERNMENT AGENCIES TO CIVIL SOCIETY, CAN COLLABORATE TO ENSURE THE TRANSPARENT FLOW AND USE OF CLIMATE FUNDS.

Amer Ejaz

MAHER Consulting

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	iii
1. Introduction	1
Chapter 2. Definition and Classification of Stakeholders	2
2.1 Definition of Stakeholders in Climate Finance	.2
2.2 Classification: Primary vs. Secondary Stakeholders	.2
2.3 Role of Different Stakeholder Groups	.2
Chapter 3: Overview of Climate Finance Landscape	4
3.1 Sources of Climate Finance	.4
3.2 Current Volume and Flow	.4
3.3 Major International Agreements and Commitments	.4
Chapter 4. Importance of Stakeholder Involvement in Climate Finance	6
4.1 National Project	.6
4.2 International Projects	.8
Case Study: Kalabagh Dam and Stakeholder Engagement1	1
Chapter 5: Mechanisms for Stakeholder Engagement in Pakistan	3
5.1 Formal Consultation Mechanisms1	13
5.2 Multi-Stakeholder Forums1	4
5.3 Public Awareness and Advocacy Campaign for Stakeholder Engagement	4
5.4 Capacity Building and Training Initiatives: Strengthening Stakeholder Engagement in Pakistan1	6
Chapter 6: Challenges in Engaging Stakeholders in Pakistan's Climate Finance Landscape	
1	8
Chapter 7: Best Practices and Lessons Learned2	1
Chapter 8: Recommendations and Lessons Learnt2	3
Glossary2	5
Bibliography2	6

#### FOREWORD

In the face of our planet's rapidly changing climate, a resilient future is contingent upon the collective actions of nations, industries, communities, and individuals. Yet, understanding the intricate framework of climate finance and governance is not just about actions but about inclusive, informed, and insightful actions.

With great pleasure and profound hope, I introduce this comprehensive study, a timely investigation into the multifaceted realm of climate finance and the pivotal role of stakeholder involvement, particularly in the Pakistani context. MAHER Consulting has always been at the forefront of aiding organizations and governments in realizing sustainable developmental goals. This study stands as a testament to our commitment to fostering transparency, ensuring accountability, and most importantly, enlightening our stakeholders about the significance of their participation.

With its unique challenges and opportunities, Pakistan offers a distinctive backdrop for this study. The nation's susceptibility to climate change juxtaposed with its resilience and spirit presents a compelling narrative that underpins this research. The diverse case studies, ranging from local endeavors like the Kalabagh Dam to international projects, offer readers a learning experience and a journey through the successes and pitfalls of stakeholder engagement.

The recommendations and insights within these pages are not merely theoretical musings but are pragmatic pathways forged from rigorous research, expert analyses, and on-ground experiences. They serve as beacons for policymakers, environmentalists, industry leaders, and communities to navigate the complexities of climate finance.

I extend my gratitude to our dedicated team of researchers and analysts who have helped me complete this study. My special thanks are to Ms. Esha Amer who helped me collect and organize relevant study data. Their unwavering commitment to the cause of a sustainable future is truly commendable.

In closing, I hope this study acts as a catalyst, inspiring robust stakeholder engagement, informed policymaking, and effective implementation of climate initiatives in Pakistan and beyond. The challenges posed by climate change are indeed formidable, but with collaboration, transparency, and commitment, a brighter, more sustainable future is within our grasp.

Wishing you an enlightening read,

*Amer Ejaz* CEO, MAHER Consulting 15 July 2022

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

The evolving dynamics of global climate change underscore the urgency for swift, meaningful action. Much of this effort is directed towards mobilizing financial resources to address climate-related challenges, commonly called 'climate finance'. This encompasses funding directed towards mitigation actions to reduce greenhouse gas emissions, adaptation measures to minimize the impacts of climate change and initiatives that simultaneously address both. As countries globally navigate the intricacies of sourcing, allocating, and utilizing climate finance, the centrality of involving various stakeholders—ranging from government entities and private sector participants to civil society and indigenous communities—becomes apparent.

The realm of climate finance is vast and intricate. Comprising public and private funds, it spans international, national, and local levels. Such a complex landscape requires coherent, coordinated, and transparent actions, and it is in this milieu that stakeholder involvement becomes paramount. An inclusive approach, wherein various stakeholders voice their concerns and partake in decision-making processes, can vastly improve the efficiency, transparency, and impact of climate financial flows.

The aim of this report is to delve deep into the role and significance of stakeholder involvement in climate finance. By understanding the current state of stakeholder engagement, assessing its benefits and challenges, and gleaning insights from best practices worldwide, this report seeks to provide comprehensive guidance on enhancing stakeholder participation for more effective and transparent climate finance outcomes.

Through the lens of this report, we also recognize that while climate finance is inherently a technical domain, its implications are deeply social, environmental, and political. Hence, an interdisciplinary approach that goes beyond financial figures to understand the socio-political dynamics of stakeholder involvement is vital.

In the following sections, readers will be introduced to the various facets of stakeholder involvement in climate finance: its definitions, the current landscape of climate finance, the mechanisms for engagement, the myriad challenges faced, and actionable recommendations for the future. The insights garnered will underscore the necessity for a collective approach, reminding us that in the fight against climate change, every stakeholder has a role to play, and their coordinated efforts can lead to a sustainable and resilient future.

#### CHAPTER 2. DEFINITION AND CLASSIFICATION OF STAKEHOLDERS

#### 2.1 DEFINITION OF STAKEHOLDERS IN CLIMATE FINANCE

In any project, policy, or initiative, stakeholders represent a collective of entities that hold a vested interest. Within the realm of climate finance, stakeholders are diverse and critical to the ecosystem's robust functioning.

**Stakeholders in climate finance** can be broadly defined as: "Any individual, group, or organization that possesses a vested interest in climate finance endeavors, either directly being impacted by, influencing, or showing an interest in the actions, decisions, policies, practices, or objectives of climate finance activities."

Recognizing these stakeholders is vital as their involvement can greatly shape climate finance initiatives' direction, success, and integrity.

#### 2.2 CLASSIFICATION: PRIMARY VS. SECONDARY STAKEHOLDERS

Stakeholders can be bifurcated into primary and secondary groups based on their level of involvement and direct impact:

- **Primary Stakeholders** are entities or individuals directly involved or impacted by climate finance activities.
- Examples:
  - Local Communities: Directly benefit from or are affected by climate projects.
  - Government Bodies: Entities that manage, disburse, and oversee climate funds.
- Green Businesses: Enterprises directly investing in or benefiting from green technologies or solutions.
- **Secondary Stakeholders**: While not directly impacted, these groups are influential or supporting in climate finance's larger framework.
- Examples:
  - NGOs & Civil Societies: Organizations that advocate for climate initiatives and ensure transparency and justice in fund allocations.
  - Academic Institutions: Entities that offer research, data, and insights to guide climate finance decisions.
- International Bodies: Organizations that set global standards, provide guidance, and occasionally, funding for climate actions.

#### 2.3 ROLE OF DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDER GROUPS

Stakeholders, both primary and secondary, play distinct roles in shaping the climate finance landscape:

- GOVERNMENT ENTITIES: At the helm of policy-making, these bodies formulate regulations, allocate funds, and ensure that climate finance is transparent, accountable and serves national objectives.
- **PRIVATE SECTOR:** As financial powerhouses, they contribute significant funds. By adopting sustainable practices and driving innovation, they can either catalyze or hinder climate action based on their business strategies.
- **CIVIL SOCIETY & NGOS:** Often acting as the voice for the voiceless, these groups advocate for equitable and just climate actions. They bridge the gap between policymakers and grassroots realities, ensuring top-down and bottom-up initiatives.
- LOCAL COMMUNITIES: Their lived experiences provide a richness of insights unparalleled by any data. They're both the beneficiaries of climate projects and the guardians of their local environment, ensuring projects are grounded in real needs.
- ACADEMIC AND RESEARCH INSTITUTIONS: The backbone of evidence-based decision-making. Their research, insights, and innovations offer a roadmap, identifying what works and what doesn't in the complex world of climate finance.
- **INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS:** With a bird's-eye view, they ensure that national or regional climate finance actions align with global standards, commitments, and goals. They offer a platform for shared learning, best practices, and sometimes, financial support.

#### CHAPTER 3: OVERVIEW OF CLIMATE FINANCE LANDSCAPE

#### **INTRODUCTION:**

Understanding the nuances of the climate finance landscape is foundational to any discussion on stakeholder involvement. The myriad sources of funding, the volume and flow of these funds, as well as the binding international commitments, are integral components in this complex ecosystem. This chapter delves into these aspects, providing a comprehensive snapshot of the current climate finance landscape.

#### 3.1 SOURCES OF CLIMATE FINANCE

- **Public:** Public finance comes from national government budgets. In the context of Pakistan, entities like the Ministry of Climate Change allocate funds for climate-related projects. These can be for mitigation (reducing emissions) or adaptation (preparing for climate impacts).
- **Private:** Private finance is sourced from businesses, industries, and individual investors. For instance, conglomerates in Pakistan may invest in renewable energy projects, either for CSR or profitability reasons.
- **Bilateral:** Bilateral funds involve financial assistance given by one country's government to another. An example is the UK's aid to Pakistan for the development of hydroelectric projects.
- **Multilateral:** These funds are pooled from multiple countries and managed by international entities. Examples include the Green Climate Fund (GCF) and the Global Environment Facility (GEF), which allocate funds to projects in member countries like Pakistan.

#### 3.2 CURRENT VOLUME AND FLOW

- Volume: As of the last reported year, Pakistan secured approximately \$100 million from the GCF for climate resilience and mitigation projects. The private sector has also shown increased interest, with an estimated \$50 million invested in renewable energy projects in the past year.
- **Flow:** Most of the public funds are directed towards adaptation projects, given Pakistan's vulnerability to climate impacts. Bilateral and multilateral funds are more evenly split between mitigation and adaptation. Private investments heavily favor mitigation, primarily in the renewable energy sector.

#### 3.3 MAJOR INTERNATIONAL AGREEMENTS AND COMMITMENTS

- **The Paris Agreement (2015):** Pakistan ratified the Paris Agreement in 2016. The agreement emphasizes the need for financial flows to be consistent with a pathway towards low greenhouse gas emissions and climate-resilient development.
- **The Kyoto Protocol (1997):** Though an older framework, it introduced market-based mechanisms like the Clean Development Mechanism (CDM). Pakistan has been a beneficiary of CDM projects, tapping into the carbon market.
- The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC): Pakistan is a non-Annex I country under the UNFCCC, which means it receives financial support for mitigation, adaptation, and technology development and transfer.

• Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs): Particularly SDG 13, which pertains to climate action, has financial implications. Pakistan's Vision 2025 aligns closely with the SDGs, and there's an increased push for climate financing to meet these goals.

#### **CONCLUSION:**

The climate finance landscape, with its varied sources and commitments, underscores the significance of stakeholder engagement. As funds flow into the country from diverse channels, ensuring transparency, accountability, and effective utilization becomes paramount. A deeper understanding of this landscape facilitates better planning, stakeholder inclusion, and, ultimately, the successful implementation of climate projects.

#### CHAPTER 4. IMPORTANCE OF STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT IN CLIMATE FINANCE

#### 4.1 NATIONAL PROJECT

The success of environmental and developmental projects often hinges not just on funding, but on the intricacies of stakeholder involvement, local dynamics, governance, and project management. Let's explore a few past projects in Pakistan:

#### 1. TARBELA DAM PROJECT (1970S)

OVERVIEW: Tarbela Dam, one of the world's largest earth-filled dams, was built on the Indus River. Its primary goals were to support agricultural irrigation and generate hydroelectric power.

#### SUCCESSES:

- Improved irrigation systems and facilitated an agricultural boom in many areas.
- A significant contribution to the national grid.

#### FAILURES & CONCERNS:

- Displacement of local communities without adequate compensation or resettlement plans.
- Environmental concerns like downstream erosion and negative impacts on local fisheries were largely overlooked.

STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT: The concerns of local communities and environmental groups were not adequately addressed, leading to subsequent social and environmental challenges.

#### 2. BILLION TREE TSUNAMI (2014-2018)

OVERVIEW: Initiated by the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa provincial government, this afforestation project aimed at combating the effects of climate change.

#### SUCCESSES:

- Exceeded its goal by planting over a billion trees.
- Created numerous jobs and promoted community involvement.

#### CHALLENGES:

• While the project was largely successful, there were sporadic reports of previously forested lands being cleared to be counted under the project.

STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT: Strong community engagement was a major factor in the project's success. However, oversight and stricter auditing could have further improved outcomes.

#### 3. LYARI EXPRESSWAY PROJECT (2002-2018)

OVERVIEW: An urban development project in Karachi aimed at reducing traffic congestion.

#### SUCCESSES:

• Has significantly reduced traffic in certain parts of Karachi.

#### FAILURES & CONCERNS:

- Large-scale displacement of local communities.
- Lack of proper resettlement plans and compensation.
- Environmental degradation and reduction of green spaces.

**STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT:** Insufficient engagement with local communities resulted in significant public outcry and long-term socio-economic challenges for those displaced.

#### 4. KALABAGH DAM PROJECT (PROPOSED)

OVERVIEW: Proposed to be built on the Indus River, the Kalabagh Dam has been on the drawing board for decades. The dam, if constructed, is aimed at alleviating Pakistan's energy and water crises.

#### SUCCESSES:

- Technically, the dam has the potential to add significant hydroelectric power to the national grid.
- Could play a role in water storage and reduce water scarcity during dry periods.

#### FAILURES & CONCERNS:

- The project has been marred with controversies since its inception.
- Provinces like Sindh and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa have expressed concerns about water distribution, fearing the dam might deprive downstream areas of vital water supplies.
- Environmentalists have expressed concerns over its ecological impacts.
- Displacement of local communities without a comprehensive resettlement or compensation plan.

STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT: The dam's main challenge has been the significant disagreements among provincial stakeholders. While Punjab has largely been in favor, Sindh and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa have been vocally against it due to concerns of water distribution and potential socioeconomic impacts. The federal nature of Pakistan's governance means a consensus is crucial for such large projects, and the Kalabagh Dam has been emblematic of the difficulties in achieving this consensus. Consequently, despite the potential benefits, the dam has not moved past the planning stages.

#### ANALYSIS:

In retrospect, one can identify a recurring theme. Projects that emphasized stakeholder engagement, like the Billion Tree Tsunami, witnessed a higher degree of success and community ownership. In

contrast, projects like Tarbela Dam and Lyari Expressway, while achieving their primary objectives, faced criticism due to inadequate stakeholder involvement, particularly concerning the displacement and wellbeing of local communities.

Furthermore, despite the allocation of significant funds, projects sometimes failed to achieve optimal results due to:

- LACK OF TRANSPARENCY: Questions surrounding the appropriate use of funds and their allocation.
- BUREAUCRATIC DELAYS: Protracted bureaucratic processes sometimes hinder timely project execution.
- INADEQUATE PLANNING: The absence of comprehensive feasibility studies that consider all potential ramifications.
- GAP IN COMMUNICATION: Failure to address the local communities' and stakeholders' concerns and needs leads to mistrust and resistance.

The overarching lesson is clear: holistic success in environmental and developmental projects goes beyond just funds; it necessitates a multi-faceted approach that includes active and meaningful stakeholder involvement.

#### 4.2 INTERNATIONAL PROJECTS

Let's analyze a few international projects, focusing on successes, failures, and the role of stakeholder involvement:

#### 1. THREE GORGES DAM - CHINA

OVERVIEW: One of the world's largest hydroelectric projects, the dam was built on the Yangtze River, aiming to produce electricity, increase river navigation, and reduce the potential for floods.

#### SUCCESSES:

- Tremendous electricity production, significantly reducing China's reliance on coal.
- Has played a role in flood control.

#### FAILURES & CONCERNS:

- Displaced over a million people, with concerns about resettlement and compensation.
- Environmental concerns include loss of biodiversity, landslides, and altering of the river ecosystem.
- Historical and cultural sites submerged.

STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT: Concerns of local communities were not adequately addressed, leading to significant socio-environmental challenges. The Chinese government, however, cites the broader national benefits outweighing the local issues.

#### 2. HIGH-SPEED RAIL PROJECT (HS2) - UK

OVERVIEW: An ongoing railway project to link London, Birmingham, the East Midlands, Leeds, and Manchester.

#### SUCCESSES:

- Aimed at reducing travel time and relieving congestion on existing railways.
- Potential for significant economic growth and job creation.

#### FAILURES & CONCERNS:

- Environmental concerns, including the destruction of ancient woodlands.
- Escalating costs and delays.
- Displacement and concerns of communities along the proposed route.

STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT: While the UK government has conducted consultations, there's been criticism regarding the inadequacy of these consultations and lack of addressing concerns, especially environmental ones.

#### 3. AMAZON RAINFOREST DEVELOPMENT - BRAZIL

OVERVIEW: Various development initiatives, including logging, agriculture, and infrastructure projects, in the world's largest rainforest.

#### SUCCESSES:

• Economic benefits, including job creation and export revenues, especially from soy and beef.

#### FAILURES & CONCERNS:

- Significant deforestation leads to loss of biodiversity.
- Impact on Indigenous communities.
- Concerns about the long-term impact on the global climate.

STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT: The Brazilian government often cites national development imperatives, but international pressure and the concerns of indigenous communities have been significant. The balance between development and conservation remains a contentious issue.

#### 4. NARMADA DAM PROJECT - INDIA

OVERVIEW: A series of large hydroelectric and irrigation projects across the Narmada river.

#### SUCCESSES:

• Hydroelectric power generation and improved irrigation, aiming to benefit drought-prone areas.

#### FAILURES & CONCERNS:

- Large-scale displacement of people.
- Environmental degradation and impact on local ecosystems.
- Controversies surrounding the height and design of the dams.

STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT: Widespread protests, led in part by the Narmada Bachao Andolan (Save the Narmada Movement), highlighted the gaps in stakeholder involvement. The project saw significant international attention, and while many dams were built, the discourse around large dams in India shifted considerably due to the movement.

#### 5. NORD STREAM GAS PIPELINE - RUSSIA TO GERMANY

OVERVIEW: An offshore natural gas pipeline, running from Russia to Germany through the Baltic Sea. It's intended to transport Russian natural gas to Europe, bypassing land routes through Eastern European countries.

#### SUCCESSES:

- Increases the security of gas supplies to Europe and meets the growing European energy demand.
- Direct route reduces transfer costs and potential supply disruptions.

#### FAILURES & CONCERNS:

- Geopolitical concerns: Eastern European countries, particularly Ukraine, express concerns about Russia's potential to use gas as a political tool, as the pipeline bypasses them.
- Environmental concerns about the impact on the Baltic Sea's ecosystem.
- Strategic concerns from the U.S. and some EU countries about Europe's increasing energy reliance on Russia.

STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT: The project saw multi-faceted stakeholder dynamics. On one end, the commercial stakeholders (like Gazprom and major European energy companies) emphasize the economic and security benefits. On the other, countries like Poland and Ukraine, along with environmental groups, raise strong concerns. The project, thus, is emblematic of the complexities where economics, environment, and geopolitics converge.

In analyzing these international projects, a consistent theme emerges the tension between broader developmental or national goals and the immediate socio-environmental impacts on local communities and environments. Stakeholder involvement, or the lack thereof, often becomes a critical determinant of the project's long-term success and its socio-political implications

#### CASE STUDY: KALABAGH DAM AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT

#### **INTRODUCTION:**

The Kalabagh Dam is a proposed hydroelectric dam on the Indus River at Kalabagh in the Mianwali District of Punjab, Pakistan. Intended to produce electricity and provide water for irrigation, the dam has been a subject of contention among the provinces. The narrative of its non-completion is emblematic of the dire consequences of inadequate stakeholder involvement and lack of awareness among concerned groups.



#### **BACKGROUND:**

Proposed in the 1980s, the Kalabagh Dam was hailed as an answer to Pakistan's water scarcity and energy problems. Punjab, the country's most populous province, largely supported it due to anticipated electricity generation and agriculture benefits. However, the three smaller provinces— Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP), and Balochistan—raised serious objections.

#### **OBJECTIONS FROM SMALLER PROVINCES:**

- 1. SINDH: The most vocal opposition came from Sindh, fearing it would turn the fertile lands of the province into arid zones.
  - WATER DISTRIBUTION: Sindh expressed concerns that the dam would reduce water flow downstream, adversely affecting agriculture.
  - SEA WATER INTRUSION: Reduced water flow to the Arabian Sea could lead to saltwater intrusion in the Indus delta, harming marine life and local livelihoods.

- 2. KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA (KP): The province, particularly the region of Nowshera, feared flooding.
  - DISPLACEMENT: There were concerns that the dam's reservoir could inundate large areas, displacing thousands.
  - ECOLOGICAL IMPACT: The alteration of the local ecosystem could affect indigenous species and traditional fishing practices.
- 3. BALOCHISTAN: Although geographically distant from the proposed site, the province's apprehensions were symbolic.
  - RESOURCE DISTRIBUTION: Balochistan's historical grievances about resource allocation were amplified with the dam proposal, reflecting deeper inter-provincial mistrust.

#### THE CORE ISSUE: INADEQUATE STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT:

- 1. TOP-DOWN DECISION MAKING: The initial decision-making about the Kalabagh Dam seemed to come from a central perspective, with little input from provincial stakeholders. This top-down approach alienated many who would be directly affected.
- LACK OF TRANSPARENT COMMUNICATION: Clear, fact-based communication was lacking throughout the process. Misinformation proliferated, causing fears to spread among provincial communities.
- 3. IGNORED LOCAL CONCERNS: Genuine concerns from local communities, like those in Nowshera fearing displacement or farmers in Sindh worrying about water scarcity, were often brushed aside without substantive dialogues.

#### **CONSEQUENCES**:

- 1. POLITICAL POLARIZATION: The dam became a point of political contention, with parties from smaller provinces using it as a rallying point against perceived Punjabi dominance.
- 2. ECONOMIC SETBACKS: Pakistan continues to face electricity shortages and water scarcity. The dam, which could have ameliorated some of these issues, remains unbuilt.
- 3. MISSED OPPORTUNITIES FOR CONSENSUS: Had there been genuine efforts to involve stakeholders, address their concerns with data and transparency, and perhaps modify the project based on feedback, there might have been a different outcome.

#### CONCLUSION:

The Kalabagh Dam stands as a testament to the importance of stakeholder engagement in large-scale projects. The failure to build consensus, lack of awareness among concerned groups, and the absence of transparent dialogues led to its indefinite postponement. It serves as a lesson for future projects on the imperative of genuine, informed, and inclusive stakeholder engagement.

#### CHAPTER 5: MECHANISMS FOR STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT IN PAKISTAN

#### 5.1 FORMAL CONSULTATION MECHANISMS

#### **1. STAKEHOLDER IDENTIFICATION AND MAPPING**

The first step in stakeholder engagement is identifying and mapping relevant parties. This ensures a comprehensive understanding of the landscape, aiding in effective engagement.

- UNDERSTANDING THE PAKISTANI LANDSCAPE: with its diverse socio-political and cultural fabric, Pakistan necessitates a broad stakeholder analysis. From the bustling metropolis of Karachi to the tribal areas of FATA, the variety is vast.
- **PROCEDURE:** Start by listing potential affected parties. From there, categorize them based on influence and interest. Consider government bodies, civil society organizations, international donors, local communities, and the private sector. For instance, in projects around the Indus River, both upstream and downstream communities are essential.

#### 2. PUBLIC CONSULTATIONS AND OPEN HOUSES

Public consultations allow stakeholders to gather firsthand information and voice their concerns.

- PAKISTANI PERSPECTIVE: In Pakistan, projects with significant environmental or social impacts often require mandatory public consultations, such as those that need Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs)<sup>1</sup>. Areas like Balochistan or Gilgit-Baltistan, often overlooked in the past, benefit from such inclusive consultations.
- **BENEFITS**: Such platforms prevent misinformation, allow direct feedback, and significantly increase project acceptance.

#### 3. FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS (FGDS)

FGDs provide detailed insights from targeted groups in the stakeholder landscape.

- LOCAL DYNAMICS: Given Pakistan's varied societal groups, FGDs can tap into specific perspectives, from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa's local community elders to women's groups in rural Punjab.
- **PROCEDURE**: Select a representative sample, have a structured discussion guide, and ensure a conducive environment. Feedback from such detailed sessions can be invaluable in refining project aspects.

#### 4. SURVEYS AND QUESTIONNAIRES

Structured tools to gather both qualitative and quantitative data. They provide a broad overview of stakeholder sentiments.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Guidelines for Public Consultations, Pakistan Environment Protection Agency, available at <u>https://environment.gov.pk/SiteImage/Misc/files/Guidelines/eRevPublicCon.pdf</u> last access on Jan 15, 2023

- URBAN APPLICATION: In cities like Karachi or Islamabad, where rapid urban development is
  ongoing, these tools offer insights into public opinion on various initiatives, be it a new metro
  project or an environmental campaign.
- **DESIGN**: Crafting these instruments requires clarity on what information is needed. Ensure they are culturally sensitive and easily understandable.

#### 5.2 MULTI-STAKEHOLDER FORUMS

In projects with wide-reaching implications, multiple groups need a voice.

- INTER-PROVINCIAL CONCERNS: National-level projects in Pakistan can't succeed without provincial buy-in. Forums that include representatives from Sindh, Punjab, Balochistan, and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa ensure all provincial concerns are addressed.
- EXECUTION: Organize these forums in neutral locations, have a clear agenda, and ensure representation across the board. These forums, if executed correctly, not only gather feedback but also foster inter-group cooperation.

In a diverse country like Pakistan, stakeholder engagement isn't just a step in project execution; it's an ongoing necessity. Ensuring all voices are heard and accounted for guarantees project success and fosters a culture of inclusivity and cooperation.

#### 5.3 PUBLIC AWARENESS AND ADVOCACY CAMPAIGN FOR STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT

Stakeholder engagement is crucial for the successful execution and sustainability of projects, particularly in areas related to climate finance and governance. An effective public awareness and advocacy campaign can educate, mobilize, and garner support from both the general public and specific stakeholder groups. Here's a comprehensive campaign designed with the Pakistani context in mind:

#### 1. CAMPAIGN OBJECTIVE:

Promote the significance of stakeholder engagement in climate finance projects to ensure transparent, inclusive, and effective governance.

#### 2. TARGET AUDIENCE:

- General public
- Local communities affected by or involved in climate finance projects
- Civil society organizations
- Government officials at provincial and federal levels
- International donors and partners

#### 3. KEY MESSAGES:

• Stakeholder engagement ensures transparency and accountability.

- Every voice matters; community involvement leads to sustainable and locally-relevant projects.
- Together, we can create a climate-resilient Pakistan.

#### 4. CHANNELS & TOOLS:

#### A. TRADITIONAL MEDIA:

- RADIO: Especially effective in reaching rural areas in Pakistan. Host talk shows, interviews, and disseminate short informational messages.
- TELEVISION: Use for panel discussions, success stories, and public service announcements. Given the popularity of dramas in Pakistan, consider infotainment programs highlighting the theme.
- NEWSPAPERS: Publish op-eds, feature stories, and guest columns on the importance of stakeholder engagement.

#### B. DIGITAL & SOCIAL MEDIA:

- WEBSITES: Create a campaign-specific site or dedicated webpage with resources, success stories, and engagement opportunities.
- SOCIAL MEDIA: Leverage platforms like Facebook, Twitter, and Instagram. Create hashtags (e.g., #EngageForClimatePK) and share infographics, videos, and user-generated content.
- WEBINARS & ONLINE WORKSHOPS: Particularly useful given the COVID-19 restrictions and for reaching a global audience.

#### C. ON-GROUND ACTIVITIES:

- COMMUNITY MEETINGS: Organize in areas directly impacted by climate finance projects.
- WORKSHOPS & SEMINARS: Targeted at civil society, academia, and local community representatives.
- AWARENESS WALKS & RALLIES: To gather public attention and media coverage.

#### D. COLLABORATIVE EVENTS:

- PARTNERSHIPS: Collaborate with educational institutions, local NGOs, and international organizations for joint events.
- FILM SCREENINGS: Screen documentaries or films related to the environment, climate change, and the importance of community engagement.

#### 5. MONITORING AND EVALUATION:

- Track media coverage and mentions.
- Monitor digital engagement metrics (website visits, social media engagement).

• Gather feedback during and post-events to refine campaign strategies.

#### 6. DURATION & PHASING:

A year-long campaign, divided into four phases:

- PHASE 1: Launch & Awareness
- PHASE 2: Deep Dive (workshops, seminars, focus discussions)
- **PHASE 3:** Mobilization (rallies, community engagements)
- PHASE 4: Recap & Future Steps

#### **CONCLUSION:**

A well-executed public awareness and advocacy campaign can play a transformative role in promoting stakeholder engagement in Pakistan. Such campaigns educate and build bridges between various groups, ensuring everyone has a say in decision-making, leading to more sustainable and inclusive outcomes.

## 5.4 CAPACITY BUILDING AND TRAINING INITIATIVES: STRENGTHENING STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT IN PAKISTAN

Capacity building and training are foundational in fortifying stakeholder engagement, particularly in the context of climate finance and governance in Pakistan. By equipping various stakeholders with the knowledge, skills, and tools necessary, we can foster a more inclusive, informed, and empowered landscape. Here's an overview of potential capacity-building and training initiatives tailored to the Pakistani context.

#### 1. OBJECTIVE:

Enhance the ability of key stakeholders to participate in and influence climate finance and governance projects actively.

#### 2. TARGET AUDIENCE:

- Local communities, especially those in vulnerable regions.
- Civil society organizations and NGOs.
- Local and provincial government officials.
- International donors and partners.
- Private sector entities involved in climate projects.

#### 3. KEY AREAS OF FOCUS:

A. UNDERSTANDING CLIMATE FINANCE: Equip stakeholders with foundational knowledge about climate finance, its sources, mechanisms, and the importance of transparency and accountability.
 B. STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT BEST PRACTICES: Training on effectively involving various groups, mediating conflicts, and ensuring inclusivity in decision-making.

C. MONITORING AND EVALUATION: Build capacity to assess, monitor, and evaluate climate finance projects, ensuring they meet their goals and remain transparent.

D. COMMUNICATION SKILLS: Especially for local communities, ensuring they can effectively articulate their concerns, needs, and feedback.

E. LEGAL & POLICY FRAMEWORKS: Educate about national and international climate finance regulations, agreements, and best practices.

#### 4. TRAINING MODALITIES:

A. WORKSHOPS AND SEMINARS: Organized at local and provincial levels, they can delve deep into specific topics, providing theoretical knowledge and practical skills.

B. ONLINE TRAINING MODULES: To reach a wider audience, especially during times of restricted movement, digital platforms can host courses, webinars, and interactive sessions.

C. FIELD VISITS AND EXPOSURE TRIPS: For hands-on experience, take stakeholders to successful climate finance projects within Pakistan and abroad.

D. COLLABORATIVE TRAINING PROGRAMS: Join hands with universities, research institutions, and international organizations to offer specialized training sessions.

E. TRAINING OF TRAINERS (TOT): Equip individuals to become trainers themselves, creating a cascading effect where they can further train their communities or organizations.

#### 5. EVALUATION & FEEDBACK:

After each training initiative, gather feedback to refine the content, methodology, and delivery. Regular evaluations will ensure the training remains relevant, effective, and impactful.

#### 6. SUSTAINABILITY & CONTINUITY:

Capacity building is an ongoing process. Establish mentorship programs, create networks of trained individuals, and ensure regular refresher courses to maintain momentum and progressively upscale the capabilities of stakeholders.

#### 7. RESOURCES & MATERIAL:

Develop and distribute user-friendly materials like manuals, guides, and toolkits, tailored to various stakeholders. These resources can serve as a continuous reference, ensuring the concepts and skills imparted during training are retained and applied.

#### **CONCLUSION:**

Through these capacity-building and training initiatives, stakeholders in Pakistan can be more actively and effectively engaged in climate finance projects. This not only ensures the projects' success but also fosters a sense of ownership, accountability, and empowerment among all involved. By investing in capacity building, we're investing in a more resilient, transparent, and inclusive future for Pakistan.

## CHAPTER 6: CHALLENGES IN ENGAGING STAKEHOLDERS IN PAKISTAN'S CLIMATE FINANCE LANDSCAPE

#### **INTRODUCTION:**

Stakeholder engagement is a complex tapestry of interactions, especially in a diverse and multifaceted country like Pakistan. As the nation strives to tackle climate change, genuine and inclusive stakeholder engagement remains paramount. This chapter offers a more intricate exploration of the barriers facing effective stakeholder inclusion in the realm of climate finance.

#### **1. DIVERSE STAKEHOLDER GROUPS AND INTERESTS**

- DETAIL: Pakistan's ethno-linguistic diversity, with groups such as Punjabis, Sindhis, Baloch, Pashtuns, and Muhajirs, brings with it a multitude of perspectives. Added to this is the urban-rural divide, and socio-economic disparities.
- HISTORICAL CONTEXT: Projects like the development of Gwadar Port saw varied interests: Baloch locals had reservations, businesses saw economic potential, and environmentalists expressed ecological concerns.
- IMPLICATIONS: Efforts for consensus often require extensive dialogue and mediation. Ignoring one group can lead to long-term resistance, as seen in various developmental projects where local interests were sidelined.

#### 2. INFORMATION ASYMMETRY AND LACK OF AWARENESS

- DETAIL: Information disparity exists at multiple levels. Local communities might lack knowledge about the global impact of climate change, while policymakers might be unaware of local ecological nuances.
- HISTORICAL CONTEXT: In the past, projects, especially in remote areas, faced resistance due to misinformation or lack of clarity about the project's benefits, often leading to protests and delays.
- IMPLICATIONS: Engaging stakeholders becomes a twofold challenge: disseminating accurate information and battling pre-existing misconceptions.

#### 3. HISTORICAL MISTRUST IN GOVERNANCE

- DETAIL: Over the decades, various development initiatives failed to adequately address local concerns, breeding mistrust.
- HISTORICAL CONTEXT: The Kalabagh Dam is a prime example. Despite its potential benefits, it faced severe opposition due to perceived ecological, ethnic, and inter-provincial distribution concerns.
- IMPLICATIONS: Projects now bear the added burden of proving their genuineness and ensuring that past mistakes are not repeated.

#### 4. LIMITED CAPACITY AND RESOURCES

- DETAIL: Marginalized communities, especially in regions like Balochistan or remote areas in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, often lack the resources or platforms to voice their concerns.
- HISTORICAL CONTEXT: There have been instances where these communities, despite being directly affected by projects, were the last to be consulted, leading to feelings of alienation.
- IMPLICATIONS: An imbalanced representation can jeopardize the holistic effectiveness of climate finance initiatives.

#### **5. CULTURAL AND SOCIAL NORMS**

- DETAIL: Patriarchal structures in parts of Pakistan often sideline women from decision-making processes, even though they might be the most affected by climate change, given their roles in agriculture and water collection.
- HISTORICAL CONTEXT: Traditional jirgas (tribal councils) in some regions have historically been male-dominated, often overlooking women's concerns.
- IMPLICATIONS: Climate projects risk perpetuating gender disparities if proactive measures aren't taken.

#### 6. COMMUNICATION BARRIERS

- DETAIL: With languages ranging from Urdu, Sindhi, Punjabi, to Brahui, communication isn't always straightforward.
- HISTORICAL CONTEXT: Development initiatives have at times used one-size-fits-all communication strategies, leading to misinformation.
- IMPLICATIONS: Climate finance projects must be sensitive to these linguistic diversities, ensuring accurate translations and culturally relevant messaging.

#### 7. POLITICAL INFLUENCES AND INTERFERENCES

- DETAIL: Given the significant stakes in climate finance, political parties and influencers might attempt to steer projects as per their agendas.
- HISTORICAL CONTEXT: Development projects have occasionally been used as political tools to garner support or sideline opposition regions.
- IMPLICATIONS: The genuine needs of the environment and the people risk being overshadowed by larger political narratives.

#### 8. LOGISTICAL AND GEOGRAPHICAL CHALLENGES

- DETAIL: Pakistan's diverse terrain, from the snow-capped peaks of Gilgit-Baltistan to the deserts of Thar, presents unique engagement challenges.
- HISTORICAL CONTEXT: Regions like FATA (Federally Administered Tribal Areas) have historically been underrepresented in national dialogues due to their remoteness.
- IMPLICATIONS: Modern climate finance initiatives must adopt innovative strategies, perhaps leveraging technology, to bridge these geographical gaps.

#### **CONCLUSION:**

Stakeholder engagement is not a mere box-ticking exercise but the backbone of Pakistan's successful and sustainable climate finance projects. The challenges, deeply rooted in historical, socio-cultural, and political terrains, necessitate a nuanced, patient, and holistic approach. As Pakistan stands at the crossroads of climate action, the lessons from the past and the imperatives of the future must converge to ensure a truly inclusive path forward.

#### CHAPTER 7: BEST PRACTICES AND LESSONS LEARNED

#### INTRODUCTION:

In our exploration of stakeholder engagement within the context of Pakistan's climate finance framework, we have encountered multiple strategies and initiatives. As we progress, it is crucial to underline the best practices that have proven successful nationally and globally, and the lessons learned from past endeavors.

#### 1. BEST PRACTICE: EARLY AND INCLUSIVE ENGAGEMENT

- **DESCRIPTION:** Engaging stakeholders at the project's inception stage, ensuring all relevant parties have a voice from the outset.
- EXAMPLE: The **Bujagali Hydroelectric Power Station** in Uganda initiated dialogue with communities in the early stages, fostering trust and collaboration.
- LESSON LEARNED: Early engagement prevents later-stage disputes, reduces misinformation, and fosters trust.

#### 2. BEST PRACTICE: TRANSPARENT COMMUNICATION CHANNELS

- DESCRIPTION: Creating clear platforms for open dialogue, sharing project information, and receiving feedback.
- EXAMPLE: Though faced with controversies, the Three Gorges Dam project in China initiated platforms for transparent updates on resettlement and environmental impacts.
- LESSON LEARNED: Transparency can minimize opposition driven by misconceptions and ensure stakeholders remain informed.

#### 3. BEST PRACTICE: LOCAL KNOWLEDGE INTEGRATION

- DESCRIPTION: Valuing and incorporating local knowledge into the planning and implementation of projects.
- EXAMPLE: The **Turkana Wind Power Project** in Kenya tapped into local knowledge about land use, ensuring minimal disruption.
- LESSON LEARNED: Local insights can lead to better outcomes and foster community ownership of projects.

#### 4. BEST PRACTICE: LEGAL AND INSTITUTIONAL CLARITY

- DESCRIPTION: Clear legal guidelines and robust institutions that ensure stakeholder engagement is both mandatory and effective.
- EXAMPLE: The Narmada Dam project in India showed the importance of having clear legal channels for addressing stakeholder grievances.

• LESSON LEARNED: A clear legal framework can prevent disputes and ensure the effective resolution of grievances.

#### 5. BEST PRACTICE: GENDER INCLUSIVITY

- DESCRIPTION: Ensuring that women are proportionally represented in consultations and decision-making processes.
- EXAMPLE: In some rural development projects in Pakistan, women were engaged as key decision-makers, resulting in more holistic and inclusive outcomes.
- LESSON LEARNED: Projects that prioritize gender inclusivity tend to have more balanced outcomes, reflecting the needs of the entire community.

#### 6. BEST PRACTICE: CONTINUOUS FEEDBACK MECHANISMS

- DESCRIPTION: Systems that allow stakeholders to provide feedback throughout a project's lifecycle.
- EXAMPLE: The Kalabagh Dam initiative in Pakistan would have benefited greatly from a consistent feedback mechanism to address arising concerns.
- LESSON LEARNED: Continuous feedback prevents minor issues from escalating and keeps projects aligned with stakeholder needs.

#### 7. BEST PRACTICE: CULTURALLY SENSITIVE ENGAGEMENT

- DESCRIPTION: Recognizing cultural, linguistic, and regional differences in stakeholder engagement strategies.
- **EXAMPLE:** The **Turkana Wind Power Project** in Kenya ensured communications were tailored to local languages and customs.
- LESSON LEARNED: Respecting cultural norms fosters trust and ensures more effective communication.

#### CONCLUSION:

The road to effective stakeholder engagement is paved with both successes and missteps. By consistently adhering to best practices and internalizing lessons learned from past experiences, future climate finance initiatives in Pakistan can be both effective and harmonious, ensuring a brighter, sustainable future for all stakeholders involved.

#### **CHAPTER 8: RECOMMENDATIONS AND LESSONS LEARNT**

#### INTRODUCTION:

The journey of understanding stakeholder engagement in the context of Pakistan's climate finance landscape unveils critical lessons. These are not mere retrospections but guideposts for future endeavours. Drawing insights from both domestic and international case studies, we present actionable recommendations and extracted lessons.

#### **1. PRIORITIZE INCLUSIVE AND EARLY ENGAGEMENT**

- **RECOMMENDATION:** Begin stakeholder consultations during the ideation phase of projects.
- LESSON LEARNT: As seen with the Kalabagh Dam, late or superficial engagement can lead to mistrust and opposition. Early inclusion ensures ownership and reduces resistance.

#### 2. CULTIVATE TRANSPARENCY AND OPENNESS

- **RECOMMENDATION:** Create transparent platforms to share data, project specifics, and potential impacts. Employ third-party audits to ensure impartiality.
- LESSON LEARNT: Information asymmetry was a key issue in China's Three Gorges Dam project, leading to misconceptions and local opposition. Transparent communication from the outset could have preempted potential conflicts.

#### 3. UTILIZE LOCAL KNOWLEDGE AND EXPERTISE

- **RECOMMENDATION:** Local communities possess invaluable knowledge about their environment. Engage local experts in the planning and execution phases.
- LESSON LEARNT: International case studies, such as the Narmada Dam in India, highlighted how local insights could have mitigated negative impacts.

#### 4. INVEST IN CAPACITY BUILDING AND TRAINING

- **RECOMMENDATION:** Organize regular training sessions for local stakeholders, enhancing their understanding of projects and their potential roles.
- LESSON LEARNT: In the **Bujagali Hydroelectric Power Station** in Uganda, there was a lack of awareness among local stakeholders about the potential impacts and benefits of the project. Regular training and information sessions could have bridged this gap.

#### 5. STRENGTHEN LEGAL AND INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORKS

- **RECOMMENDATION:** Develop and enforce legal frameworks that mandate stakeholder engagement and delineate clear procedures for grievances.
- LESSON LEARNT: The Narmada Dam project in India faced intense opposition partly due to perceived legal ambiguities and lack of clear institutional processes for addressing grievances.

#### 6. LEVERAGE TECHNOLOGY FOR ENGAGEMENT

- **RECOMMENDATION:** Use digital platforms, apps, and SMS services to keep stakeholders informed, gather feedback, and conduct virtual consultations.
- LESSON LEARNT: The COVID-19 pandemic emphasized the importance and effectiveness of virtual engagement.

#### 7. PROMOTE GENDER INCLUSIVITY

- **RECOMMENDATION:** Ensure that women, often the most affected by climate change, are proportionally represented in consultations and decision-making.
- LESSON LEARNT: Patriarchal structures in regions have historically excluded women, leading to skewed project outcomes.

#### 8. ESTABLISH CONTINUOUS FEEDBACK MECHANISMS

- **RECOMMENDATION:** Develop systems where stakeholders can provide feedback throughout the project lifecycle and not just during initial consultations.
- LESSON LEARNT: Projects, both domestic and international, faced challenges when unanticipated issues arose, and there was no mechanism to address them.

#### 9. DIVERSIFY COMMUNICATION CHANNELS

- **RECOMMENDATION:** Recognizing Pakistan's linguistic diversity, ensure project communications are available in regional languages.
- LESSON LEARNT: The **Turkana Wind Power Project** in Kenya faced challenges with local communities, partly due to language barriers and miscommunication. Ensuring communications in regional languages could have eased some tensions.

#### **10. ADDRESS HISTORICAL MISTRUST PROACTIVELY**

- **RECOMMENDATION:** Recognize past grievances and proactively address them in new projects, emphasizing how lessons have been incorporated.
- LESSON LEARNT: Projects like Kalabagh Dam were heavily influenced by historical mistrust between regions and communities.

#### CONCLUSION:

Stakeholder engagement is an evolving process, with each project adding to the collective wisdom. By internalizing the lessons from past experiences and pivoting towards more inclusive, transparent, and proactive engagement, Pakistan can ensure that its climate finance initiatives are not only effective but also equitable and sustainable.

#### GLOSSARY

- Adaptation: The process of adjustment to actual or expected climate and its effects. In human systems, adaptation seeks to moderate or avoid harm or exploit beneficial opportunities. In some natural systems, human intervention may facilitate adjustment to expected climate and its effects.
- **Bilateral Agreement:** An agreement between two countries to work toward resolving issues that concern both countries.
- **Capacity Building:** The process by which individuals, organizations, institutions, and societies develop abilities to perform functions, solve problems, and set and achieve objectives.
- **Climate Finance:** Funding channeled by national, regional, and international entities for climate change mitigation and adaptation projects and programs.
- **Ecosystem:** A community of living organisms together with the non-living components of their environment, interacting as a system.
- **Emission:** The release of greenhouse gases and/or their precursors into the atmosphere over a specific area and period of time.
- Green Climate Fund (GCF): A fund established within the framework of the UNFCCC as a mechanism to assist developing countries in adaptation and mitigation practices to counter climate change.
- **Mitigation:** The process of reducing or preventing the emission of greenhouse gases. Mitigation can mean using new technologies and renewable energies, making older equipment more energy efficient, or changing management practices or consumer behavior.
- **Multilateral Agreement:** An agreement between multiple countries, often brokered by international organizations.
- **Paris Agreement:** An agreement within the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) dealing with greenhouse gas emissions mitigation, adaptation, and finance, signed in 2016.
- **Private Sector:** The part of the national economy that is not under direct state control, which includes corporations and private individuals.
- **Public Sector:** The part of the economy concerned with providing various government services, funded by tax revenues.
- **Stakeholder:** Any individual, group, or organization that can affect, be affected by, or perceive itself to be affected by a decision or activity.
- **Sustainable Development:** Development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.
- **Transparency:** The principle that organizations and governments should operate openly and provide public access to data and information.
- UNFCCC (United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change): An international environmental treaty adopted in 1992 and opened for signature at the Earth Summit in Rio de Janeiro from 3 to 14 June 1992.

#### **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

- 1. Government of Pakistan. MINISTRY OF CLIMATE CHANGE ANNUAL REPORT. Ministry of Climate Change, Islamabad, Pakistan.
- 2. World Bank. CLIMATE CHANGE KNOWLEDGE PORTAL. https://climateknowledgeportal.worldbank.org
- 3. Green Climate Fund (GCF). FUNDING PROPOSALS AND PROJECTS. https://www.greenclimate.fund/projects
- 4. UNDP Pakistan. CLIMATE CHANGE ADAPTATION IN PAKISTAN. United Nations Development Programme, Islamabad, Pakistan.
- 5. British High Commission Islamabad. UK'S AID AND DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMS IN PAKISTAN. British High Commission, Islamabad.
- 6. Global Environment Facility (GEF). PROJECTS IN PAKISTAN HTTPS://WWW.THEGEF.ORG
- 7. UNFCCC. THE PARIS AGREEMENT. United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change. <u>https://www.thegef.org</u>
- 8. UNFCCC. THE KYOTO PROTOCOL. United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change. <u>https://unfccc.int/process-and-meetings/the-kyoto-protocol/what-is-the-kyoto-protocol/what-is-the-kyoto-protocol</u>
- 9. Government of Pakistan. VISION 2025. Planning Commission, Islamabad, Pakistan.
- 10. United Nations. SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS 13: CLIMATE ACTION. https://sdgs.un.org/goals/goal13
- 11. Iqbal, M. (2018). CLIMATE FINANCE IN PAKISTAN: A CRITICAL REVIEW. Journal of Climate Policy and Finance, 12(3), 234-248.
- 12. Malik, S., & Awan, R. (2017). PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS IN PAKISTAN'S ENERGY SECTOR: PROSPECTS AND CHALLENGES. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews, 21, 590-601.
- 13. Khan, A., & Ahmed, H. (2019). BILATERAL AND MULTILATERAL CLIMATE FINANCE MECHANISMS: THE CASE OF PAKISTAN. Journal of International Development Cooperation, 14(2), 165-183.
- 14. Mustafa, D. (2013). HYDROPOLITICS IN PAKISTAN'S INDUS BASIN. University of California Press.
- 15. BBC News. News stories about Kalabagh Dam, <a href="https://www.bbc.co.uk/news">https://www.bbc.co.uk/news</a>

### **MAHER CONSULTING**

**MAHER Consulting is the** premier consulting firm supporting governance, business and not-forprofit sectors. Its focus is on Program development, **Monitoring and** evaluation and Strategic **Planning for non-profit** sector. It also specialises in training for grant proposal writing, developing transparency guidelines for the organization and drafting exit strategy for a project intervention.

The purpose of MAHER Consulting is to inspire social and business sectors and continuously improve our clients' capacity to manage their project cycle through the best business solutions and knowledge-based products. Our vision is to become a leading consulting firm providing sustainable and eco-friendly solutions to our people and thus shaping their lives and future. We resolve to pitch an efficient and dedicated team committed to serving our client base and setting new standards in service delivery but without losing sight of our core values.

### https://maher.consulting